

## Meeting Minutes

### Food Africa Project Finalization Retreat 10-12 October 2016

ADESIDA, Babatomiwa, Manager, Sahara Foundation  
AGBESOR, Precious, Associate Professional Officer, FAO Nigeria  
AHIMIE, Uade, Head Corporate Governance, Sahara Group  
COLE, Tonye, CEO, Sahara Group  
MINTIN, Chris Bitrus, Kaduna State, Ministry of Agriculture & Forestry  
DURÁN, Paloma, Director, SDG Fund  
EMEKA-ANUNA, Chinyere, National Programme Coordinator ILO, Nigeria  
JAIYESIMI, Omolola, Sahara Group  
MANI, Rabe, Assistant Representative, FAO Nigeria  
OFIDHE, Ufuoma, Special Assistant to the Commissioner of Agriculture  
OJURONGBE, Seyi, Programme Manager, Sahara Group  
SAYERS, Ian, Head, Sector Development, Division of Market Development, ITC, Geneva  
TALL, Nourou Macki, Representative a.i., FAO Nigeria  
WONG, Catherine, Programme Specialist, SDG Fund  
ZULU, Dennis, Representative, ILO, Nigeria

#### Meeting Summary - General Issues

1. 20<sup>th</sup> October deadline to submit letter of **matching funds contributions**, in order to sign project document on 31 October 2016
2. **Budget** – staff and consultants costs are US\$ 1 million: review and reduce, increase grants and split monitoring and evaluation
3. All data on beneficiaries should be disaggregated by sex
4. Harmonizing of training costs? Note the template provided uses the UNDG budget lines, i.e. venue under contracts, etc.: See UNDG guidance on budget lines [here](#)
5. Introduce everywhere flexible term for facilities and processing centre in project document, work plan, etc. – **Done** – **Catherine**
6. New activity on specialized horticulture products incorporated into project document and work plan
7. Share log-in for the SDGF platform with everyone – **as below**:
  - a. <http://proposals.sdgfund.org/>  
Login: Nigeria  
Password: Ivuluwugu362
8. Share SDG Fund communications guidelines – **Done** - **Raul**
9. Note: current UNDAF ends 2017, no mapping took place against SDGs
10. ITC to share template for farmer profiling
11. Leveraging synergies to avoid duplication – **Huan, SDGF is finalizing matrix on all ongoing projects**
  - a. Take stock of outputs from completed and ongoing projects - FAO's AMIS project already focusing on price information, see below for details
    - i. FAO has materials on irrigation, harvesting practices, PHL, but doesn't yet materials on GAP or tomato Ebola - check if Ministry has?
  - b. Take stock of existing training materials available - ILO has WIND, TREE, SIYB methodologies which could be translated into Hausa
  - c. Check with Ufuoma any DFID training materials available?

- d. Training and or any other field visits – please coordinate to reduce pressure on MOAF and
- 12. Sahara followed up with FMWR regarding transfer of land deeds on Thursday 13 October; survey of project site at Jere was completed already, however FMWR indicated that according to their rules, they would need to conduct their own study – **Already done – Tomiwa**
- 13. For approval purposes: show schematic plan for 7 ha at project site at Jere – *Sahara can prepare something in-house*

Meeting Summary - Additional inputs on Project Document and Work Plan, etc.

- 14. ITC to provide inputs on:
  - a. Financial inclusion and information gaps - **Already shared by Ian**
  - b. Market sustainability
  - c. Environmental accounting to section on Climate Change and Sustainability - **Already shared by Ian**
  - d. Text on byproducts – add to page 11 - **Already shared by Ian**
- 15. FAO to provide inputs on
  - a. NGOs supporting women's participation to section on Civil Society
  - b. FAO Inputs on page 14
  - c. FAO and ITC to add inputs to Output 4 on page 17
  - d. FAO and ITC to restructure focusing on outreach - Output 3
  - e. References to FAO's related ongoing projects:
    - i. Kaduna State Government - Commercial Agriculture Project (?) in Jere, which focus on agricultural lowlands project in project background
    - ii. Add information on - FAO Youth Empowerment project in Jere area – mid-level agropreneurs – this would be very useful to the Output 2.1 - FAO will check how many beneficiaries
    - iii. FAO project on Tomato Ebola - integrated pest management – Kaduna State one of focus areas - just approved last Friday
    - iv. AMIS project – See below minutes from meeting with FAO on 13 October 2016
- 16. ToT draft – FAO, ILO and ITC to add inputs - what the business model is? Include buyers, collectors, etc. as potential participants
- 17. Remove market bazaar; Rephrase Output 1.2 to include Network and outreach
  - a. Mini-mart, farmers' market and/or demonstration site onsite – **Done - Catherine**
- 18. Activities under Output 1.3 consider merging with Output 1.1 or 1.2
- 19. TOT – incorporate occupational safety and health training – ILO will provide further inputs
- 20. Ian: Send people to look at price of produce - price information service - calculate margins fuse.net - commodities and forecasting Food security sector group - daily bulletins – *Note: this is already being done under FAO AMIS project, see notes below*
- 21. Costing of fencing – ITC can share estimates
- 22. Costing of land at Jere, 50,000 Naira/hectare year; estimate of 50 million Naira to be included in project document for reference purposes only. Actual cost per hectare will be confirmed from the Federal Ministry of Water Resources

Comments and Recommendations from MOAF/Commissioner's Office:

23. **Signature by the Governor** – Governor may ask Executive Council for approval, also need approval of Chief Executive of State –
  - a. For Commissioner to sign, would need no objection from Governor –
24. Add references to ongoing DFID, World Bank, etc. work
  - a. GEMS 4
  - b. Rockefeller
  - c. Also see “Kaduna State Agriculture Report”
    - i. **already shared by Ufuoma**
25. Prototype of similar facility will be built in Kuban? - check with Ufuoma
26. Show site plan for 7ha — basic outline of packing facility by EATAGRO – Sahara can draw something up – **Already shared by Ufuoma**
27. Check Pampaida project in Ikara local government – very successful; yields and incomes in this area have remained consistently higher since
  - a. **Done - Catherine – This the [Millennium Village Project](#)**
28. See Zamani Foundation based in Kaduna - currently works with UNWomen – **Details already shared by Ufuoma**
29. Check Ministry of Rural Development GAP project - Maigana – **Already shared by Ufuoma**
30. Ensure scoping and good knowledge management, institutional memory is often lost after project closure or when key focal points leave
31. Ensure measurement against SDGs in logframe: note: Federal Government is developing its own monitoring system for SDGs – **Huan is preparing an annex**
32. Check FAO rules on clearance – a request from Governor is needed – **Done – Catherine - FAO indicates everything is in order**
33. For approval purposes: show schematic plan for 7 ha at project site at Jere – *Sahara can prepare something in-house*

## Site Visit to Jere on 12 October 2016

ADESIDA, Babatomiwa, Manager, Sahara Foundation  
 AGBESOR, Precious, Associate Professional Officer, FAO Nigeria  
 OFIDHE, Ufuoma, Special Assistant to the Commissioner of Agriculture  
 OJURONGBE, Seyi, Programme Manager, Sahara Group  
 SAYERS, Ian, Head, Sector Development, Division of Market Development, ITC, Geneva  
 WONG, Catherine, Programme Specialist, SDG Fund  
 Chris Bitrus Mintin, Kaduna State, Ministry of Agriculture & Forestry

### Catherine's Notes on Women Beneficiaries:

34. Met group of eight women beneficiaries, all lived in immediate vicinity, estimated 35-55 years of age, all members of the same cooperative, there were several other members, all women, who were not there that day; *note the group of women kept a distance from the men and would not approach when invited, I spoke to them separately; Ian's notes below cover the group of men*
35. Only engaged in farming activities, no other sources of income
36. Organized into cooperatives by government 3-4 years ago, leased land locally, up to 10 ha each, land is irrigated

37. Produce sold in 20 kg basket in a number of local markets nearby, did/could not sell everything they grew, losses of an estimated 30-40% or more – although the women did not keep records of costs, yields or losses
38. Prices varied greatly; at the moment, because of Tomato Ebola, 5000 Naira/basket, prices also high around holiday periods, many markets in the area apart from the main one at crossroads Jere which we passed along the way
39. Had not participated in any UN project/programme
40. Had access to extension services, had not participated in any testing of any mobile app – but would be interested if available; all had 2G phones and were banked
41. Approximately 30 cooperatives in areas; how many women led cooperatives? They couldn't say, maybe 3-4, minimum of 10 members, no problems with loans, rented equipment, vans
42. 6,000ha irrigation project – pivot irrigation system cost 17 billion naira, already operational
43. Biggest challenges: market, tuta absoluta/ pests, good quality seeds, land - would rent more land if possible
44. All children of school age in school, in the area
45. Challenges for women in particular: looking after family and work – “it's hard being a woman, women have to strive”; what do the men do? Some help, although some women are heads of households as they are widowed (i.e. Victoria, was widowed four years ago, has five children), some also rely on hired labour and also their children

#### Ian's Notes on Group of Male Farmers – Approximately 25-30 men

46. Crops grown: tomato, maize, ginger, sweet pepper, aubergine, garden egg, hot pepper, okra, cassava TMS variety – slightly toxic one – most of times make it into starch, yam, rice, cow pea mostly white, some yellow, soya, watermelon
47. Clusters in 200 hectares – owned by FMWR
48. Individuals have 20-40 hectare plots, 50-60 plots – 2960 covered by pivot irrigation – more than 4000 ha that could be irrigated, if they paid for lease, mostly alkaline soils
49. Counselor Chairman, Ali Rachma (?) – indicated better seedlings were needed
50. Where did they get seeds from? KADP
51. Cooperatives kept records
52. Cooperatives received assistance on maize, World Bank project in 2015
53. Received training in aflatoxins, No aflatoxin control
54. Rent tractors, planting machines

#### Precious's Note on Irrigation System

55. Main source of water is from Gurara Dam about 15-20km to the proposed project site
56. Raw water is transferred through 15-20km of DN 1400 steel pipeline to the irrigated land area
57. Centre Pivot (CP) irrigation systems were working as at the time of the visit and are mostly used by the commercial farmers. However, small scale farmers/ farmers group reticulate the water for use as surface irrigation which is suitable for the type of crops cultivated (2-3 hectare with small pumps)
58. Farmers pay a water fee of ₦25,000.00 equivalent to US\$79.37 per hectare per year
59. Farmers specialize in all the crops. However, they cultivate more Pepper and Tomatoes because of its high demand than other crops
60. Major market for sales of their produce is along Abuja Kaduna express way
  - a. National Irrigation Policy and Strategy Document (2015) in shared drive

## Meetings with FAO and ILO on 13-14 October 2016

### Notes from meeting with FAO – 13 October 2016

AKINRINLOLA Adeola, Programme Assistant, FAO Nigeria  
IBRAHIM, SaAdiya, Programme Officer, FAO Nigeria  
JABARR, Fisayo J., Research and Operations Assistant, FAO  
MANI, Rabe, Assistant Representative, FAO Nigeria  
OYAWALE, Olutayo, AMIS Project, FAO Nigeria  
WONG, Catherine, Programme Specialist, SDG Fund

61. No further edits or comments on project document, work plan, etc. beyond those given at the retreat
62. No FAO staff/staff time will be charged to project
63. Wages for Facility Manager: typical wages of facility manager in Lagos would be 15,000-20,000 Naira/month: about US\$ 930 at current official UN exchange rate of 1:315, allow US\$ 15,000 just in case
64. With size of project/number of counterparts: consider another retreat, so that technical focal points are up-to-date
65. Reconsider the project name – too general – **see proposed long name for technical documents**
66. Second mission conducted to Jere, Kaduna on 13 October 2016 with FAO Expert Abigail from Accra and a Professor from a university in Zaria
- 67. Agricultural Market Information System project**
  - a. implemented by Tayo: project duration 2014 – 2017: pilot collecting information on prices, wholesale, retail and farm gate, three states: Kaduna, Abuja and Niger – 300 farmers in Kaduna
  - b. Database runs on Android phones; <http://www.amis-outlook.org/>; Text version will be created for 2G phones
  - c. Will have localization in all three major dialects in Nigeria
  - d. Currently exploring crowdfunding
  - e. Also see **Premise** <http://www.premise.com/whatwedo/> – which will allow anyone with a smart phone to record prices in realtime, by submitting photos which they will pay for

### Notes from meeting with ILO – 14 October 2016

ASHIRU, Kareem, ILO, Nigeria  
EMEKA-ANUNA, Chinyere, National Programme Coordinator ILO, Nigeria  
WONG, Catherine, Programme Specialist, SDG Fund

68. Work plan - add ILO to value chain study – ILO will ask UN Women to share any existing data on women in Kaduna - **Done - Chi Chi/Catherine**
69. ILO has many established methodologies: WISE and Global Action for WIND methodologies, will be used; OSH materials are available in English which it can simplify and translate into Hausa – Chi Chi will check how much time is needed for trainings – all materials already piloted and proven successful in many countries Africa and LAC and proven
70. ILO Agricultural OSH safety profile work with Government is ongoing and directly relevant to project

71. UN staff time is not charged – bear in mind the significant in-kind contributions from Staff which is not costed into the project
72. Better to merge all miscellaneous costs together as one activity under PMO costs at end of work plan
73. How to cost any venue hire and food farmers during training – in “Contracts”?
74. Could help to identify more youth with participation of FAO from their Youth in Agriculture Project and KSG
75. TOT draft shared, ILO will add further inputs
76. Don't forget to add operating capital to plant operational costs for outgrowers scheme
77. Synchronize training where possible, i.e. business training on bookkeeping
78. Share information on Leventis training – [see here](#)
79. Reconsider project name as it does not explain the scope of the project: all of FAO's work is on food and agriculture
80. Kareem's suggestions on ICT and data integrity:
  - f. Mitigate potential for moral hazard in registration of farmers by using biometric data and geographic coordinates/GIS when recording plots to ensure data integrity and effective monitoring; free/low-cost android based systems can take finger prints and log coordinates
  - g. GSM coverage is very poor, in some places less than 40% and in many areas in Northern Nigeria even less; should not be relied upon, consider instead agricultural drones - also useful for monitoring in the case of outgrowers' scheme
  - h. Also consider Microsoft [TV White Space](#), i.e. unutilized television spectrum, which is an inexpensive solution to internet connectivity and has advantages over GSM in remote terrains – where for many telecom companies, establishing infrastructure is not so cost effective, frequencies lower than cellphones, spanning 10-15km